



An Australian Government Initiative



# **Market-based tools for environmental management**

**Proceedings of the 6th annual AARES national symposium 2003**

**A report for the RIRDC/Land & Water Australia/FWPRDC/MDBC  
Joint Venture Agroforestry Program**

Edited by Stuart Whitten, Marc Carter  
and Gary Stoneham

October 2004

RIRDC Publication No 04/142  
RIRDC Project No WS034-01

© 2004 Rural Industries Research and Development Corporation.

All rights reserved.

ISBN 1 74151 050 3

ISSN 1440-6845

***Market-based tools for environmental management***

*Publication No. 04/142*

*Project No. WS034-01*

The views expressed and the conclusions reached in this publication are those of the authors and not necessarily those of persons consulted. RIRDC shall not be responsible in any way whatsoever to any person who relies in whole or in part on the contents of this report.

This publication is copyright. However, RIRDC encourages wide dissemination of its research, providing the Corporation is clearly acknowledged. For any other enquiries concerning reproduction, contact the Publications Manager on phone 02 6272 3186.

**Editor Contact Details**

Stuart Whitten  
CSIRO Sustainable Ecosystems  
GPO Box 284  
CANBERRA ACT 2601  
Phone: (02) 6242 1683  
Fax: (02) 6242 1705  
Email: [Stuart.Whitten@csiro.au](mailto:Stuart.Whitten@csiro.au)

In submitting this report, the researchers have agreed to RIRDC publishing this material in its edited form.

**RIRDC Contact Details**

Rural Industries Research and Development Corporation  
Level 1, AMA House  
42 Macquarie Street  
BARTON ACT 2600

PO Box 4776  
KINGSTON ACT 2604

Phone: 02 6272 4539  
Fax: 02 6272 5877  
Email: [rirdc@rirdc.gov.au](mailto:rirdc@rirdc.gov.au)  
Website: <http://www.rirdc.gov.au>

Published in October 2004

Printed on environmentally friendly paper by Canprint

# Foreword

The potential of market-based instruments is increasingly being considered in the debate about the appropriateness of alternative options for management of natural resources and the environment. More particularly, there is a growing interest in creating market-like mechanisms to manage environmental outputs at the lowest economic cost. With this focus comes a need to build capacity in communities, government and research organisations as to how, when and where these tools should be applied.

To meet this need, the Australian Agricultural and Resource Economics Society, with the generous support of sponsors, organised a two-day symposium focusing on market-based instruments that was held 2-3 September 2003 at CSIRO Discovery Centre in Canberra. Contributors included individual members of the Society, invited speakers and authors of poster papers. Each of these contributors gave a great deal of their time to prepare and present a series of papers of the highest quality which have been captured in this edited volume of proceedings from the symposium. Where papers were not available, or the level of interest merited additional information, the editors have sourced additional papers together with more complete papers from the winners of poster paper prizes at the symposium.

I would like to commend and thank the AARES organising committee (and editors of this volume). The committee was chaired by Dr Stuart Whitten (CSIRO Sustainable Ecosystems), and comprised Mr Marc Carter (Environmental Economics Unit, Australian Government Department of Environment and Heritage) and Mr Gary Stoneham (Victorian Department of Primary Industries). The conference organiser was All Occasions Management. Together they have done an excellent job in constructing an outstanding program that has resulted in the high quality papers published herein.

These proceedings were funded by the Joint Venture Agroforestry Program (JVAP), which is supported by three R&D Corporations - Rural Industries Research and Development Corporation (RIRDC), Land & Water Australia, and Forest and Wood Products Research and Development Corporation (FWPRDC), together with the Murray Darling Basin Commission (MDBC). These agencies are funded principally by the Australian Government.

This volume, a new addition to RIRDC's diverse range of over 1000 research publications, forms part of our Agroforestry and Farm Forestry R&D program, which aims to integrate sustainable and productive agroforestry within Australian farming systems.

Most of our publications are available for viewing, downloading or purchasing online through our website:

- downloads at [www.rirdc.gov.au/reports/Index.htm](http://www.rirdc.gov.au/reports/Index.htm)
- purchases at [www.rirdc.gov.au/eshop](http://www.rirdc.gov.au/eshop)

**Simon Hearn**

Managing Director

Rural Industries Research and Development Corporation

# Symposium sponsors

Market-based tools for environmental management : The 6th annual AARES national symposium, September 2003

## Premier sponsor



The National Market-based Instruments Pilots Program

A joint Initiative of all States, Territories and the Commonwealth under the National Action Plan for Salinity and Water Quality



## Gold sponsors



## Silver sponsors



## Session sponsor



## Bronze sponsors



# Acknowledgements

On behalf of the Australian Agricultural and Resource Economics Society, the Symposium Organising Committee; Stuart Whitten (CSIRO Sustainable Ecosystems) Marc Carter (Environmental Economics Unit, Dept. of Environment and Heritage) Gary Stoneham (Victorian Dept of Primary Industries); wish to thank the Symposium sponsors; listed on page *iv*; the assistance of: Professor Jeff Bennett, Colin Mues, Cathryn Geiger, Heather McGilvray, Martin van Bueren, Wendy Proctor, Dave Shelton and Mandy Yialeloglou; and all participants and speakers at the symposium.

## Abbreviations

BMP	Best Management Practices
CO <sub>2</sub>	Carbon dioxide
COAG	Council of Australian Governments
CRP	Conservation Reserve Program
DIPNR	Department of Infrastructure, Planning and Natural Resources
EBI	Environmental Benefits Index
EPA	Environmental Protection Agency
FI	Flexible Incentives
HRSTS	The Hunter River Salinity Trading Scheme
LMT	Land Management Tender
LPCIS	Liverpool Plains Catchment Investment Strategy
LPLMC	Liverpool Plains Land Management Committee
MBI	Market-based instruments
MRET	Federal Mandatory Renewable Energy Target
NAPSWQ	National Action Plan for Salinity and Water Quality
NEM	National Electricity Market
NGAC	NSW Greenhouse Abatement Certificates
NHT	Natural Heritage trust
NRE	Natural Resources and Environment (Victorian Department of)
OC	Opportunity Cost
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
P-NP	Point, non-point
PPA	Power Purchase Agreement
PRC	Pollution reduction credits
REC	Renewable Energy Certificate
RECLAIM	Regional Clean Air Incentive Market
SO <sub>2</sub>	Sulphur dioxide
WTP	Willingness-To-Pay

# Contents

<b>Foreword</b> .....	<b>iii</b>
<b>Symposium sponsors</b> .....	<b>iv</b>
<b>Acknowledgements</b> .....	<b>v</b>
<b>Abbreviations</b> .....	<b>v</b>
<b>Contents</b> .....	<b>vi</b>
<b>Opening address</b> .....	<b>1</b>
Mr Roger Beale	
<b>Day 1</b> .....	<b>6</b>
<b>Session 1: Setting the scene: What are market-based tools and why use them?</b> .....	<b>6</b>
An overview of market-based instruments and environmental policy in Australia .....	6
Stuart Whitten, Martin van Bueren and Drew Collins	
Market based instruments and NRM: Back to basics.....	24
Associate Professor Vivek Chaudhri	
<b>Session 2a: Australian MBI case studies – what can we learn from them?.....</b>	<b>33</b>
Auctioning conservation contracts: evaluating Victoria's BushTender Trial.....	33
Gary Stoneham, Vivek Chaudhri*, Arthur Ha and Loris Strappazon.	
What have we learnt from the Hunter River Salinity Trading Scheme? .....	47
Simon Smith	
<b>Session 2b: New MBIs: Short papers from poster paper prize winners.....</b>	<b>55</b>
Experience with market-based approaches to climate change regulation in the Australian electricity industry.....	55
Iain MacGill, Hugh Outhred and Karel Nolles	
Conservation Auctions and Land Management Tenders.....	62
Di Bentely, and Warwick Moss	
Establishing east-west corridors in the Desert Uplands .....	67
John Rolfe and Juliana McCosker	
<b>Session 3: New tools and new policy impetus</b> .....	<b>71</b>
An overview of the ideas and information needed to develop and implement market-based instruments .....	71
Gary Stoneham	
Market based tools for environmental management.....	79
Jackie Biro	
<b>Day 2</b> .....	<b>84</b>
<b>Session 1: New MBI tools = new ways to address environmental management issues</b> .....	<b>84</b>
Missing markets and the design of environmental “Market Based Instruments”.....	84
Professor Peter Bardsley	
Market-based instruments – International patterns of adoption, remaining challenges, and emerging approaches.....	93
Professor Alan Randall	
What new tools and techniques have been tested internationally? How do they work? What is their potential for application to NRM problems? .....	106
Professor Charles R. Plott	
The role of laboratory experiments in the demonstration and design of markets for pollution .....	107
Lata Gangadharan and Charlotte Duke	

<b>Session 2: Lessons for Australian MBI development (Three parallel poster paper sessions)</b> .....	<b>125</b>
<b>Session 3: Limits to markets and integration</b> .....	<b>125</b>
The importance of targets and values in market-based instrument development.....	125
Jeff Bennett	
Should equity concerns impose limits on the use of market-based instruments?.....	132
Steven G.M. Schilizzi	
Where do market-based mechanisms fit in the policy mix? An economic analysis.....	152
Loris Strappazon, Gary Stoneham and Nicola Lansdel	
Appendix A: The nature of environmental goods .....	178
Appendix B: The demand for offsets .....	179
<b>Session 4: Closing plenary session</b> .....	<b>180</b>
Market-based tools for environmental management: Where do they fit and where to next?.....	180
Stuart Whitten and Mike Young	
<b>Appendix 1: Lessons for Australian MBI development</b> .....	<b>191</b>
Contributed Poster Paper Abstracts.....	191
** Possibilities to use market based tools for management of phosphorus pollution from point and non-point sources in a watershed .....	191
** Land management tenders on the Liverpool Plains .....	192
Auction for landscape recovery in southwest Australia. ....	192
BushBroker: A broker for biodiversity credits.....	193
** Green offsets for sustainable regional development.....	193
Water = Ecology + Money: Community management of environmental water for wetlands.....	194
** Cap and Trade for Salinity: Property rights and private abatement, a laboratory experiment market.....	195
Enterprise based conservation - conservation as a commercial land use .....	195
** Get more out of cost sharing with risk ranking and cooperative action .....	196
** Assessing the applicability of economic policy instruments for dryland salinity management in Western Australia .....	197
** Utilizing contingent claims to improve livestock waste management .....	197
NSW Environmental Services Scheme – new income streams for farmers .....	198
Auctioning habitat links & carbon sinks - an MBI for carbon sink establishment in Victoria. ....	198
** Selecting market based instruments to drive change in natural resource management.....	199
** Experience with market-based approaches to climate change regulation in the Australian electricity industry .....	200
** Establishing east-west landscape corridors in the southern Desert Uplands. ....	200
Market based incentives and improving the management of floodplain wetlands in the Murrumbidgee River, NSW .....	201
Lessons on the design and implementation of renewable energy, greenpower and greenhouse emissions abatement markets from the financial markets. ....	201
** Market based instruments for ecosystem services in the Murrindindi Shire of Victoria .....	202
** Trading salt and water: developing tradable property rights for dryland salinity management using an experimental approach .....	202
** Establishing the potential for offset trading in the lower Fitzroy River.....	203
Defining the Bios: an objective basis for biodiversity market systems.....	203
** Multiple-outcome auction of land-use change .....	204
** Tradable recharge credits in Coleambally Irrigation Area .....	204
<b>Appendix 2: Glossary of Market-based Instrument Terms</b> .....	<b>206</b>